
PRESENTERS

John Land, Kensington Swan, Auckland

John specialises in competition law and commercial litigation. He has been with Kensington Swan for 25 years and has been a partner of that firm since 1993. John has been involved in a large number of major competition law cases including recently as senior counsel for a group of major retailers in proceedings against Visa and MasterCard and the major trading banks alleging price fixing of credit card interchange fees and anti-competitive credit card scheme rules. He is also senior counsel for a major international airline defending proceedings by the Commerce Commission relating to the alleged fixing of fuel surcharges on the carriage of cargo by air.

John has published widely in the field of competition law, and is a frequent speaker and commentator at conferences on competition law subjects. He is a member of the advisory board on the Competition Law and Policy Institute of New Zealand.

Tom Weston QC, Christchurch

Tom has a broad-based commercial litigation practice with a particular focus on competition law. He is currently acting for an international airline that is one of a number of defendants in a penalty action brought by the Commerce Commission. Tom practises from chambers in Auckland and Christchurch. He is the Chief Justice of the Cook Islands (a part-time position).

Acknowledgement

With thanks to Imelda-Rose Sheerin, Senior Associate in the Competition Law team at Kensington Swan for invaluable assistance with this paper.

The statements and conclusions contained in this booklet are those of the author(s) only and not those of the New Zealand Law Society. This booklet has been prepared for the purpose of a Continuing Legal Education course. It is not intended to be a comprehensive statement of the law or practice, and should not be relied upon as such. If advice on the law is required, it should be sought on a formal, professional basis.

CONTENTS

1. GENERAL OVERVIEW.....	1
2. MARKET DEFINITION.....	3
GENERAL PRINCIPLES	3
THE SSNIP TEST (OR HYPOTHETICAL MONOPOLIST TEST)	3
DEFINING MARKETS IN THE CASE OF POTENTIAL TRANSACTIONS.....	4
MARKET DEFINITION AS A TOOL OF ANALYSIS	5
THE PRODUCT DIMENSION OF THE MARKET.....	5
GEOGRAPHIC DIMENSION OF THE MARKET.....	7
FUNCTIONAL MARKET DIMENSION	9
TEMPORAL DIMENSION OF MARKETS	9
CUSTOMER DIMENSION OF MARKET	9
3. OUTLINE OF SECTION 27.....	11
CONTRACTS OR ARRANGEMENTS SUBSTANTIALLY LESSENING COMPETITION.....	11
CONTRACT, ARRANGEMENT, OR UNDERSTANDING.....	11
PURPOSE OF SUBSTANTIAL LESSENING OF COMPETITION	12
EFFECT OR LIKELY EFFECT OF SUBSTANTIAL LESSENING OF COMPETITION—COUNTERFACTUAL ANALYSIS	13
MEANING OF “LIKELY” EFFECT OF SUBSTANTIAL LESSENING OF COMPETITION	14
MEANING OF “COMPETITION”	15
MEANING OF “LESSENING” OF COMPETITION	16
MEANING OF “SUBSTANTIAL” LESSENING OF COMPETITION.....	17
TIME PERIOD OVER WHICH LESSENING OF COMPETITION CONSIDERED.....	17
COMBINATION OF CONTRACTS FOR PURPOSE OF ASSESSMENT OF ANTI-COMPETITIVE EFFECT	18
4. OUTLINE OF SECTION 30.....	19
CONTROLLING OR MAINTAINING OF PRICE	20
JOINT VENTURE EXEMPTION.....	21
5. PROPOSED REFORM OF PROHIBITIONS AGAINST PRICE FIXING AND OTHER CARTEL CONDUCT	23
BACKGROUND TO THE BILL	23
KEY CARTEL FEATURES OF THE BILL	24
<i>Cartel offence</i>	24
EXEMPTION FOR COLLABORATIVE ACTIVITY	26
CLEARANCES FOR COLLABORATIVE ACTIVITY	27
EXEMPTION FOR VERTICAL SUPPLY CONTRACTS.....	27
JOINT BUYING AND PROMOTION AGREEMENTS.....	28
PENALTIES FOR BREACH	28
6. OUTLINE OF SECTION 36.....	31
MARKET POWER	31
SUBSTANTIAL DEGREE OF MARKET POWER	31
TAKING ADVANTAGE OF SUBSTANTIAL MARKET POWER.....	32
ANTICOMPETITIVE PURPOSE	33
COMMERCE COMMISSION V TELECOM CORPORATION OF NEW ZEALAND LTD.....	34
<i>Facts</i>	34
<i>Market and dominance</i>	35
<i>Use of a dominant position</i>	36
<i>Materially facilitated test</i>	37
<i>A rigorous approach to counterfactual analysis</i>	38
APPLICATION OF MATERIALLY FACILITATED TEST IN AUSTRALIA	38
7. RESALE PRICE MAINTENANCE	39
SUPPLY	42
SPECIFIED PRICE	42

WHAT ABOUT RECOMMENDED RETAIL PRICES?	43
8. INFORMATION EXCHANGE BY COMPETITORS	45
MEETINGS TO DISCUSS PRICES AND POTENTIAL LIABILITY WHEN YOU DON'T SPEAK UP	47
DISCUSSIONS OF PRODUCT OFFERINGS THAT IMPACT ON PRICE	48
DISCUSSIONS OF PRICES THAT DON'T LEAD TO AGREEMENT AND POTENTIAL LIABILITY FOR SUGGESTING AGREEMENT	48
JOINT BIDS	48
GENERAL GUIDELINES FOR TRADERS	49
9. FRANCHISES	51
REFUSAL TO SUPPLY FRANCHISEES	51
EXCLUSIVE DEALING OR LOYALTY REBATES.....	52
REQUIRING FRANCHISEES TO PURCHASE PRODUCTS ONLY FROM A PARTICULAR SOURCE	53
PRICE FIXING IN THE FRANCHISE CONTEXT	53
RESALE PRICE MAINTENANCE	54
MAXIMUM PRICING ENFORCED BY FRANCHISOR	55
JOINT BUYING	55
MARKET SHARING	56
10. JOINT VENTURES	57
JOINT VENTURES INVOLVING BUSINESS ASSET ACQUISITIONS	57
JOINT VENTURES INVOLVING SHARE ACQUISITIONS	58
PRICE FIXING AND JOINT VENTURES	59
PRICING BY UNINCORPORATED JOINT VENTURES SUPPLYING GOODS	60
PRICING BY UNINCORPORATED JOINT VENTURES SUPPLYING SERVICES	60
PRICING BY INCORPORATED JOINT VENTURES	63
EXCHANGE OF INFORMATION BY JOINT VENTURE PARTIES	63
11. TRADE ASSOCIATIONS.....	65
CONTRACTS, ARRANGEMENTS OR UNDERSTANDINGS THAT SUBSTANTIALLY LESSEN COMPETITION.....	65
PRICE RECOMMENDATIONS	66
EXCLUSIONARY PROVISIONS	67
TAKING ADVANTAGE OF MARKET POWER	68
KEY RISK AREAS FOR TRADE ASSOCIATIONS	68
<i>Membership criteria</i>	68
MEETINGS.....	69
COMMUNICATIONS WITH MEMBERS/PRICE INFORMATION EXCHANGES	69
12. REFUSALS TO SUPPLY/DEAL.....	71
COLLECTIVE REFUSALS TO SUPPLY	71
INDIVIDUAL REFUSALS TO SUPPLY	71
MISUSE OF MARKET POWER	71
RESALE PRICE MAINTENANCE	73
13. TYING ARRANGEMENTS AND BUNDLING.....	75
THE APPROACH OF THE AUSTRALIAN COURTS	76
GENERAL GUIDELINES	77
14. EXCLUSIVE DEALING	79
NEW ZEALAND CASE LAW.....	79
<i>Fisher & Paykel Ltd v Commerce Commission</i>	79
AUSTRALIAN CASE LAW	80
<i>Melway</i>	80
<i>Cool & Sons Pty Ltd v O'Brien Glass Industries Ltd</i>	81
15. BELOW-COST PRICING	83
SECTION 36 OR 27?	83
RECOUPMENT OF LOSS	84
NEW ZEALAND CASE LAW.....	84
<i>Port Nelson</i>	84

<i>Carter Holt</i>	85
AUSTRALIAN CASE LAW.....	86
<i>Boral</i>	86
IS RECOUPMENT NECESSARY?.....	88
<i>Measure of costs</i>	88
16. INTERFACE WITH INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY.....	91
LICENCE OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY RIGHTS.....	91
SECTION 45 EXEMPTION.....	91
SECTION 36(3) EXEMPTION.....	92
17. COMMERCE COMMISSION INVESTIGATIONS.....	95
INITIAL RESPONSE.....	95
INFORMAL INFORMATION GATHERING.....	96
SECTION 98 NOTICES.....	96
INFORMATION/DOCUMENT REQUESTS PURSUANT TO SECTION 98.....	97
SECTION 98 INTERVIEWS.....	99
SEARCH WARRANTS UNDER COMMERCE ACT.....	101
CEASE AND DESIST ORDERS.....	103
MISCELLANEOUS CONSIDERATIONS.....	104
18. COMMERCE COMMISSION LENIENCY APPLICATIONS.....	105
CONDITIONS FOR IMMUNITY.....	105
EXTENT OF IMMUNITY.....	106
DEALING WITH THE RISKS OF MAKING A LENIENCY APPLICATION.....	106
FIRST STEP IN SEEKING IMMUNITY—PLACING A MARKER.....	107
SECOND STEP IN SEEKING IMMUNITY—THE PROFFER.....	108
THIRD STEP IN SEEKING IMMUNITY—CONDITIONAL IMMUNITY AGREEMENT.....	109
OTHER ASPECTS OF LENIENCY POLICY.....	110
19. COMMERCE COMMISSION ENFORCEMENT CRITERIA.....	113
ENFORCEMENT OPTIONS.....	113
20. DAMAGES.....	115
GENERAL PROPOSITIONS RELATING TO ASSESSMENT OF DAMAGES IN COMMERCE ACT CASES.....	115
WHAT IS THE HARM?—THE DAMAGE CAUSED BY ANTI-COMPETITIVE BEHAVIOUR.....	116
WHICH KINDS OF LOSS CAN BE CLAIMED?—COMPENSATORY DAMAGES FOR ANTI-COMPETITIVE BEHAVIOUR.....	117
WHO CAN CLAIM?—THE PASSING ON DEFENCE AND INDIRECT PURCHASER STANDING.....	118
HOW MUCH CAN THEY CLAIM?—QUANTIFYING COMPENSATORY DAMAGES.....	121
EXEMPLARY DAMAGES.....	123
21. PENALTIES.....	125
22. MERGERS AND BUSINESS ACQUISITIONS.....	127
MERGER TEST.....	127
THE NEW ZEALAND CLEARANCE PROCEDURE.....	128
SAFE HARBOURS.....	131
<i>Example</i>	132
RELEVANT FACTORS.....	133
THE COMMISSION’S ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK.....	134
COMMISSION’S ANALYTICAL FRAMEWORK FOR ASSESSING A SUBSTANTIAL LESSENING OF COMPETITION	135
THE COMMISSION’S APPROACH TO “SUBSTANTIAL LESSENING OF COMPETITION”.....	136
THE COUNTERFACTUAL.....	137
ANALYSIS OF EXISTING COMPETITION.....	137
ANALYSIS OF POTENTIAL COMPETITION.....	138
ANALYSIS OF OTHER COMPETITION FACTORS.....	139
ANALYSIS OF MARKET POWER.....	140
OVERALL CONSIDERATION.....	140
23. AUTHORISATION APPLICATIONS.....	143

STREAMLINED AUTHORISATION PROCESS	143
THE PROCESS FOR AUTHORISATION DECISIONS	144
THE PUBLIC BENEFIT/DETRIMENT TEST	144
THE DETRIMENTS NORMALLY CONSIDERED ON AN AUTHORISATION APPLICATION	145
ALLOCATIVE INEFFICIENCY AND TRANSFER DETRIMENTS	145
PRODUCTIVE EFFICIENCY LOSSES.....	145
DYNAMIC EFFICIENCY LOSSES	145
PUBLIC BENEFITS NORMALLY CONSIDERED ON AN AUTHORISATION APPLICATION	145
DISTRIBUTIONAL ISSUES ON AN AUTHORISATION APPLICATION	146
RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICES AUTHORISATIONS	146
BUSINESS ACQUISITIONS AUTHORISATIONS	147
AMENDMENT AND REVOCATION OF A RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICE AUTHORISATION	148
RECENT APPEAL AGAINST AUTHORISATION DECISION	149
SCHEDULE 1	150
DIAGRAMMATIC SUMMARY OF APPLICATION FOR AUTHORISATION OF A RESTRICTIVE TRADE PRACTICE (RTP).....	150
SCHEDULE 2.....	151
DIAGRAMMATIC SUMMARY OF APPLICATION FOR AUTHORISATION OF A BUSINESS ACQUISITION	151